

APPENDIX 1

For the Sub-Committee's consideration

- (a) The complaint and documents submitted by the Complainant.**
- (b) Comments of the Member dated 7th November 2017.**



COMPLAINT FORM

YOUR DETAILS

1. Please provide us with your name and contact details:

Title:	Alderman Sir
First name:	Michael
Last name:	Bear
Address:	Members' Room Guildhall London EC2P 2EJ
Daytime telephone:	
Evening telephone:	
Mobile telephone:	
Email address:	michael@thebearsinc.com

Your address and contact details will not usually be released unless necessary or to deal with your complaint.

However, we will tell the following people that you have made this complaint:-

- The Member that you are complaining about;
- The Monitoring Officer of the City of London Corporation.

We will normally tell them your name and give them full details of your complaint. If you have serious concerns about your name and details of your complaint being released, please complete section 5 of this form.

2. Please tell us which complainant type best describes you:

- Member of the public
- An elected or co-opted Member of the City of London Corporation
- An employee of the City of London Corporation
- Other (please specify.....)

MAKING YOUR COMPLAINT

3. Please provide us with the name of the member(s) you believe have breached the Code of Conduct:

Title	First name	Last name
Mr	Prem	Goyal CC

4. Please explain in this section (or on separate sheets) what the member has done that you believe breaches the Code of Conduct. If you are complaining about more than one member, you should clearly explain what each individual person has done that you believe breaches the Code of Conduct.

It is important that you provide all the information you wish to have taken into account by the assessment sub Committee when it decides whether to take any action on your complaint. For example:-

- You should be specific, wherever possible, about exactly what you are alleging the member said or did. For instance, instead of writing that the member insulted you, you should state what it was they said.
- You should provide the dates of the alleged incidents wherever possible. If you cannot provide exact dates, it is important to give a general timeframe.
- You should confirm whether there are any witnesses to the alleged conduct and provide their names and contact details if possible.
- You should provide any relevant background information.
- If possible, please be specific about which paragraphs of the Code of Conduct you believe have been breached.

Please provide us with the details of your complaint. Continue on a separate sheet if there is not enough space on this form.

My attention was drawn last week to a suggestion that Mr Goyal had been using the Corporation's IT, printing and copying facilities in respect of his prospective candidacy for the Aldermanic seat in the Ward of Portsoken from which I will retire later this year. I attach a copy of the leaflet which Mr Goyal has circulated within the Ward.

I wrote to Mr Goyal on Friday 20 October, in the following terms, and received a reply from Mr Goyal at 15:27 the same day with his responses marked in red:

From: Michael Bear [mailto:michael@thebearsinc.com]
Sent: 20 October 2017 09:35
To: Prem Goyal <prem.goyal@globalmarketsconsultants.com>
Subject: Prem_Goyal_Portsoken_Alderman_Candidate_Leaflet_1.pdf

Prem,

I have been passed your election leaflet. - Noted.

This was distributed before I wrote to the LM surrendering my office which is interesting. - Noted

But more importantly could you confirm that you did not use any Corporation of London equipment or resource in the production, copying or distribution of this election leaflet. I confirm that I used the coloured printer to print the information leaflet outside of the election regulated period. as I don't have a fast speed printer. I didn't think that it would be an issue; but if this is an issue, I will be more than happy to reimbursement promptly to the Corporation of London. Note that I am not at all planning to use the printer or any other resources during the election expense regulated campaign period, starting November 14. I would welcome your guidance in this matter.

Best

Michael

I responded shortly thereafter:

From: Michael Bear [mailto:michael@thebearsinc.com]
Sent: 20 October 2017 16:19
To: Prem Goyal <prem.goyal@globalmarketsconsultants.com>
Subject: Re: Prem_Goyal_Portsoken_Alderman_Candidate_Leaflet_1.pdf

Prem,
How extensively did you use the Corporation printer?

Best

M

To which he replied:

From: Prem Goyal <prem.goyal@globalmarketsconsultants.com>
Date: 20 October 2017 at 16:30:12 BST
To: 'Michael Bear' <michael@thebearsinc.com>
Subject: RE: Prem_Goyal_Portsoken_Alderman_Candidate_Leaflet_1.pdf

Hi Michael

Thanks for your prompt email.

To provide one information leaflet to all voters (700) and some more. My very conservative estimate is 1,000.

With Best Wishes

Prem

In light of his clear admission that he has used Corporation resources to print material in connection with an election, it would appear to me that there is a prima facie case that Mr Goyal is in breach of the Members' Code of Conduct, specifically:

1 a. SELFLESSNESS: Holders of public office should act solely in the public interest and should never improperly confer an advantage or disadvantage on any person or act to gain financial or other material benefits for themselves, their family, a friend or close associate.

By using Corporation resources rather than paying for paper and printing himself, Mr Goyal is clearly obtaining an advantage for himself.

2 i. Ensuring that, when using or authorising the use by others the resources of the Corporation, such resources of the Corporation, such resources are not used improperly for political purposes (including party political purposes) and having regard to any applicable Local Authority Code of Publicity made under the Local Government Act 1986.

Again by using Corporation resources in connection with an election campaign, Mr Goyal is without doubt using those resources improperly for political purposes.

In light of Mr Goyal's admitted misconduct, I would ask that the Monitoring Officer refer this matter to a Standards Sub-Committee on an expedited basis for Assessment and Hearing as soon as practicable.

PREM GOYAL OBE JP

PRIORITISING PORTSOKEN



My name is Prem Goyal, an elected City Councilman and CEO of Global Markets Consultants (GMC), a consulting firm in the City.

I am writing to you as I'm standing as an Aldermanic candidate for Portsoken.

I love the Portsoken community where my friends, staff and I live and work: I've lived and worked in the Portsoken area for 18 years. I have loyally supported local businesses, including restaurants, barbers, shops and gym, for 18 years. To introduce myself further, I've included my journey, CV and involvement in Portsoken and in the City. You can find out more by visiting: www.globalmarketsconsultants.com/prem-goyal

Portsoken is my home. I've walked on Minorles, Mansell Street and Middlesex Street several times every day for 18 years and made lifelong friendships with local business owners and residents on both estates. I will put your interests first every day as your Alderman. I will prioritise Portsoken.

I'd love to introduce myself to you and ensure that I prioritise your ideas and concerns in my manifesto. Please contact me at 07719035409 or prem.goyal@cityoflondon.gov.uk

Prem Goyal OBE JP

My Journey

My story began in Delhi, India, where I grew up the youngest of 11 children. During my summers, I would stay at my sister's house; her place had no bathroom, no running water and one electric light. I remember collecting five buckets of buffalo dung every day, which I'd shape into pancakes, slap on the wall to dry and use for fuel. Back then I was the local dung collector champion!

Later, having graduated from the Indian Institute of Technology near Kolkata, West Bengal, with a Bachelor's degree in Engineering, I was lucky to go to New York on a teaching scholarship. But my excitement at flying for the first time was short lived. I only had \$20 to get me through my first seven days! Nonetheless, having scraped by on minimum wage by cutting grass, I worked hard and graduated with a Master's degree in Engineering. I then got a job as a professional transport engineer.

After saving \$50,000 over six years, I can't tell you how happy I was when I was able to pursue my next dream of completing an MBA from UCLA. After graduation, I worked 80 hours a week in New York, Tokyo and Zurich and gained the best international work experience from multinational institutions.

Having lived in three continents, I settled in the City of London in an apartment on Minorles and rediscovered my love for curry, cricket and Tower Bridge! In 2002, I launched my consulting company, GMC, with offices first on Liverpool Street, then on Houndsditch, then in Devonshire Square and now near Tower/ DLR station. I have created hundreds of jobs and internships since then. I'm proud that the UK has recognised my contributions, including receiving an OBE from HRH Prince Charles in 2013.

Now retired, I serve as a magistrate and share my business acumen with SMEs and charities which promote diversity, help young people find jobs and care for the elderly. I also participate, support and contribute to community events in Portsoken, the City and Tower Hamlets. I want to continue to use my talent, time and savings to give back to Portsoken what it has given me. I love Portsoken.

Prem Goyal CV

Business Experience

- **CEO, Global Markets Consultants (GMC), Portsoken Area** Feb 2002 – present
- **Project Manager, Deutsche Bank (DB), Portsoken Area** Jul 1999 – Jan 2002
- **Business Analyst, Lehman Bros / Citibank / DB (New York, Zurich & Tokyo)** Jul 1995 – Jul 1999
- **Associate, Sales and Trading, Goldman Sachs, New York** Aug 1994 – Jul 1995
- **Project Engineer, Raymond Keyes Associates, New York** Aug 1988 – Jul 1992

Education

- **Executive Education (ADP), Chicago Business School, City of London** Feb 2010
- **MBA, Anderson School of Management at UCLA, Los Angeles** Jun 1994
- **MS in Engineering, Clarkson University, New York** May 1988
- **BS in Engineering, Indian Institute of Technology (IIT), West Bengal** May 1986

Honours

- **Community Spirit Award, London Leadership and Peace Awards** 2014
- **OBE for services to the economy and promoting charitable giving** 2013
- **Lunch with HM The Queen on the top table, Diamond Jubilee Celebration** 2012

Charity / Civic Involvement

- **Elected City Councilman** 2017
- **Raised £300,000 for various charities to date**
 - **£25,000 for Attlee Foundation, supporting young people, Portsoken Area** 2010
 - **£7,000 for Get Kids Going by completing the London Marathon** 2000
- **Providing business expertise to c. 25 charities / civic organizations, including:**
 - **Justice of the Peace (JP), Tower Hamlets and Newham** 2009 - present
 - **Trustee, Attlee Foundation, Portsoken Area** 2009 - 2012
 - **Governor, Tower Hamlets College** 2010 - 2013

Interests

- **Cooking, travelling (I've travelled to 135 countries, including Bangladesh / Colombia) and swimming**

Involvement in Portsoken / City of London

- **GMC Offices from February 2002 to present**
 - **Wormwood St, Liverpool St, St Mary Axe, Devonshire Square and near Tower / DLR station**
- **Resident since August 1999**
 - **Minorities (3 years), Wormwood Street (4 years), Shad Thames (9 years), Tower Bridge (2 years)**
- **Portsoken Ward Club Committee Member and Aldgate Community Events Board Member**
- **Support Portsoken businesses and organisations daily**
 - **Mumbai Square, La Piazzetta, Tiffinbox, Nisa newsagents, Co-op, Jad's Hairdressing, Virgin Minorities Gym, Sir John Cass's Foundation Primary School, St Botolph Church and more.**
- **Sharing business expertise with SMEs in the area, including Oasis Café and Jad's Hairdressing**
- **Organise, participate and contribute to Portsoken community events:**
 - **Eid, Halloween and Christmas celebrations, Mansell Street Estate Garden Competition, Portsoken Gardening and Chess Clubs, training courses and certifications for residents, Fundays and Podium Party, Fruit Picking trip and residents' outings, recognising community champions with GMC Awards and many more.**
- **Mentoring c.20 young people from Portsoken in one-to-one sessions on higher education, careers and jobs advice to help them realise their full potential.**

Prem Goyal OBE JP
Members' Room
PO Box 270
Guildhall
London EC2P 2EJ

Michael Cogher
Comptroller and City Solicitor
Guildhall
London EC2P 2EJ

7 November 2017

Dear Mr Cogher,

Written Submission to the Assessment Sub (Standards) Committee – Prem Goyal

I have received your letter dated 26 October regarding the complaint submitted to you by Alderman Sir Michael Bear. Please see below my written submission for the Assessment Sub (Standards) Committee.

I would like the Assessment Sub (Standards) committee to note the following in mitigation:

This situation has arisen due to my lack of experience as an elected member: my election on 23 March 2017, seven months ago, was the first time I was elected to public office.

Unfortunately, I was unable to attend the Corporation's induction training on the Members' Code of Conduct for new members: I sincerely regret that.

In response to the two charges against me:

1 a. **SELFLESSNESS:** Holders of public office should act solely in the public interest and should never improperly confer an advantage or disadvantage on any person or act to gain financial or other material benefits for themselves, their family, a friend or close associate.

I have been honest, transparent and straightforward from the moment I received Alderman Bear's first email. I responded to his emails on the same day – the second email within minutes – and with full disclosure.

It was never my intention to use City resources to save the cost of printing this leaflet externally or by using my own printer, which has a commercial value of about £65. Instead, I used Corporation's three printers in parallel for the sole purpose of completing this task in 30 minutes. If I had used my printer it would have taken two hours to complete the job.

Additionally, the printing task did not negatively impact the performance of any other Member. As a matter of fact, I have actively used my own financial and company resources to support the City's agenda and charitable activities.

-7-

To resolve this breach properly and promptly, I will cooperate fully with the Committee. As a starting point, I'm willing to offer the following:

1. Apologise to Alderman Bear for breaching the Members' Code of Conduct and using Corporation resources incorrectly.
2. Complete the next training session on the Members' Code of Conduct run by the City Corporation and any other training recommended by the Committee.
3. Pledge not to repeat this mistake in the future.
4. Reimburse the Corporation 100% of the cost of the leaflet expense. I am willingly to accept the Corporation estimated cost with appropriate penalty.

2 i. Ensuring that, when using or authorising the use by others the resources of the Corporation, such resources of the Corporation, such resources are not used improperly for political purposes (including party political purposes) and having regard to any applicable Local Authority Code of Publicity made under the Local Government Act 1986.

As previously stated, I have been honest and straightforward with Alderman Bear and it was not my intention to use City resources to save the estimated cost of printing this leaflet externally or by using my own printer.

I would also like to add that before I printed the leaflet, I purposely checked the posters and information in the Members' Room. However, there was no guidance regarding printing or technology usage.

To resolve this charge properly and promptly, I want to cooperate fully with the Committee. As a starting point, I'm willing to complete the following:

1. Apologise to Alderman Bear for breaching the Members' Code of Conduct and using Corporation resources incorrectly.
2. Complete the next training session on the Members' Code of Conduct run by the City Corporation and any other training recommended by the Committee.
3. Pledge not to repeat this mistake in the future.

I welcome any other appropriate recommendations from the Committee to resolve these two charges properly and promptly.

If you have any questions or need more information, please do contact me.

With best wishes,

Prem Goyal OBE JP